

Agenda Item G, EQC Discussion: EQC Contested Case Procedures
June 22-23, 2006, EQC Meeting

OAR 340-011-0575 Review of Proposed Orders in Contested Cases

(1) For purposes of this rule, filing means receipt in the office of the director or other office of the department.

(2) Following the close of the record for a contested case hearing, the administrative law judge will issue a proposed order. The administrative law judge will serve the proposed order on each participant.

(3) Commencement of Review by the Commission: The proposed order will become final unless a participant or a member of the commission files, with the commission, a Petition for Commission Review within 30 days of service of the proposed order. The timely filing of a Petition is a jurisdictional requirement and cannot be waived. Any participant may file a petition whether or not another participant has filed a petition.

(4) Contents of the Petition for Commission Review. A petition must be in writing and need only state the participant's or a commissioner's intent that the commission review the proposed order. Each petition and subsequent brief must be captioned to indicate the participant filing the document and the type of document (for example: Respondents Exceptions and Brief; Department's Answer to Respondent's Exceptions and Brief).

(5) Procedures on Review:

(a) Exceptions and Brief: Within 30 days from the filing of a petition, the participant(s) filing the petition must file written exceptions and brief. The exceptions must specify those findings and conclusions objected to, and also include proposed alternative findings of fact, conclusions of law, and order with specific references to the parts of the record upon which the participant relies. The brief must include the arguments supporting these alternative findings of fact, conclusions of law and order. Failure to take an exception to a finding or conclusion in the brief, waives the participant's ability to later raise that exception.

(b) Answering Brief: Each participant, except for the participant(s) filing that exceptions and brief, will have 30 days from the date of filing of the exceptions and brief under subsection (5)(a), in which to file an answering brief.

(c) Reply Brief: If an answering brief is filed, the participant(s) who filed a petition will have 20 days from the date of filing of the answering brief under subsection (5)(b), in which to file a reply brief.

(d) Briefing on Commission Invoked Review: When one or more members of the commission wish to review the proposed order, and no participant has timely filed a Petition, the chair of the commission will promptly notify the participants of the issue that the commission desires the participants to brief. The participants must limit their briefs to those issues. The chair of the commission will also establish the schedule for filing of briefs. When the commission wishes to review the proposed order and a participant also requested review, briefing will follow the schedule set forth in subsections (a), (b), and (c) of this section.

(e) Extensions: The commission or director may extend any of the time limits contained in section (5) of this rule. Each extension request must be in writing and filed

with the commission before the expiration of the time limit. Any request for an extension may be granted or denied in whole or in part.

(f) Dismissal: The commission may dismiss any petition, upon motion of any participant or on its own motion, if the participant(s) seeking review fails to timely file the exceptions or brief required under subsection (5)(a) of this rule. A motion to dismiss made by a participant must be filed within 45 days after the filing of the Petition. At the time of dismissal, the commission will also enter a final order upholding the proposed order.

(g) Oral Argument: Following the expiration of the time allowed the participants to present exceptions and briefs, the matter will be scheduled for oral argument before the commission.

(6) Additional Evidence: A request to present additional evidence must be submitted by motion and must be accompanied by a statement showing good cause for the failure to present the evidence to the administrative law judge. The motion must accompany the brief filed under subsection (5)(a) or (b) of this rule. If the commission grants the motion or decides on its own motion that additional evidence is necessary, the matter will be remanded to an administrative law judge for further proceedings.

(7) Scope of Review: The commission may substitute its judgment for that of the administrative law judge in making any particular finding of fact, conclusion of law, or order except as limited by OAR 137-003-0655 and 137-003-0665.

(8) Service of documents on other participants: All documents required to be filed with the commission under this rule must also be served upon each participant in the contested case hearing. Service can be completed by personal service, certified mail or regular mail.

Stat. Auth.: ORS 183.341 & 468.020; Stats. Implemented: ORS 183.460, 183,464 & ORS 183.470; Hist.: DEQ 78, f. 9-6-74, ef. 9-25-74; DEQ 115, f. & ef. 7-6-76; DEQ 25-1979, f. & ef. 7-5-79; DEQ 7-1988, f. & cert. ef. 5-6-88; DEQ 1-2000(Temp), f. 2-15-00, cert. ef. 2-15-00 thru 7-31-00; DEQ 9-2000, f. & cert. ef. 7-21-00; Renumbered from 340-011-0132 by DEQ 18-2003, f. & cert. ef. 12-12-03